

Contents

Chapter 1 Introduction	1
Chapter 2 Comparative Advertising in the United Kingdom	5
2.1 Self-Regulation	6
2.2 Common Law	8
(a) Passing Off	8
(b) Injurious Falsehood	9
(c) Defamation	13
2.3 Statute	16
(a) Civil and Criminal Actions	16
(b) Trade Mark and Comparative Advertising	18
(i) Trade Marks Act 1938 section 4(1)	19
(ii) Trade Marks Act 1994 section 10(6)	22
2.4 Conclusion	26
Chapter 3 Comparative Advertising in Germany	29
3.1 The History of §1 UWG	31
3.2 The Application of §1 UWG to Comparative Advertising	33
3.3 The Judicial Implementation of the Directive	37
Chapter 4 The History, Scope and Exclusivity of the Directive	41
4.1 History of the Directive	4
4.2 Scope of the Directive	44
(a) 'Advertising'	44
(b) 'Competitor'	45
(c) The Mode of the Comparative Reference	46
(d) The Content of the Comparative Reference	48

Contents

4.3 Exclusivity of the Directive	51
(a) Pre-emption of More Liberal Regimes	51
(b) Pre-emption of Trade Mark and Copyright Law	52
Chapter 5 The Substance of the Directive	57
5.1 The Apparent Purpose of the Directive	57
5.2 Comparative Advertising Incapable of Assisting Rational Consumer Choice	59
(a) Misleading Advertising	59
(b) Comparing Like with Like	66
(c) Objectively Comparing Material, Relevant, Verifiable and Representative Features	69
(i) The Interpretation of Article 3a(1)(c)	69
(ii) The Breadth of Article 3a(1)(c)	72
(iii) The Policy of Article 3a(1)(c)	74
5.3 Comparisons that do More than is Necessary to Assist Rational Consumer Choice	76
(a) Denigration	80
(b) Taking Unfair Advantage	82
Chapter 6 The Implementation of the Directive	87
Chapter 7 The Way Forward	91
Appendix I United Kingdom Materials	97
1. Advertising Code	97
2. The ITC Code of Advertising Standards and Practice	98
3. Radio Authority Advertising and Sponsorship Code	99
4. Trade Marks Act 1994, section 10(6)	100
5. <i>Barclays Bank PLC v. RBS Advanta</i> (Chancery Division, 26 January 1996, Laddie J, [1996] RPC 307)	102
6. <i>Vodafone Group PLC v. Orange Personal Communications Services Ltd.</i> (Chancery Division, 10 July 1996, Jacob J [1997] FSR 34)	108

7. <i>British Telecommunications PLC v. AT & T Communications (UK) Ltd.</i> , (Chancery Division, 18 December 1996, M. Crystal QC Unreported)	119
8. <i>Cable & Wireless PLC v. British Telecommunications PLC</i> (Chancery Division, 8 December 1997, Jacob J [1998] FSR 383)	127
9. <i>Emaco Ltd. v. Dyson Appliances Ltd.</i> , (Chancery Division, 26 January 1999, Parker J, Unreported)	133
Appendix II German Materials	143
1. § Gesetz gegen den unlauteren Wettbewerb	143
2. <i>Testpreis-Angebot</i> (Bundesgerichtshof, 1ZR 211/95, 5 February 1998)	143
3. <i>Preisvergleichsliste II</i> (Bundesgerichtshof, No.1 ZR 2/96, 23 April 1998)	152
4. <i>Vergleichen Sie</i> (Bundesgerichtshof No.1 ZR 69/96, 15 October 1998)	156
5. <i>McDonald's/Burger King</i> (Landgericht Köln No. 81 0 185/98, 29 January 1999)	161
Appendix III European Community Preparatory Materials	167
1. Explanatory Memorandum to the Draft of 1991, COM(91)147 final-SYN 343, Brussels, 21 June 1991	167
2. Explanatory Memorandum to the Draft of 1991, COM(94)151 final-COD 343, Brussels, 21 April 1994	188
3. Opinion of the Commission on the European Parliament's Amendments to the Council's Common Position (COM(96)700) final-COD 343, Brussels, 13 December 1996	196
4. The Text of the 1991 Draft, 1994 Draft and Council's Common Position	198
Appendix IV Directive 97/55/EC (OJ 1997 L290/18)	223